DESCRIPTION OF BIRD TRACKS FROM THE KITADANI FORMATION (APTIAN), KATSUYAMA, FUKUI, JAPAN WITH THREE-DIMENSIONAL IMAGING TECHNIQUES

Takuya IMAI^{1,2}, Yuta TSUKIJI³ and Yoichi AZUMA^{1,4}

¹ Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum, 51-11 Terao, Muroko, Katsuyama, Fukui 911-8601, Japan

² Graduate School of Natural Science and Technology, Kanazawa University, Kakuma, Kanazawa, Ishikawa 920-1192, Japan ³ Department of Earth and Planetary Systems Science, Graduate School of Science, Hiroshima University, 1-3-1 Kagamiyama,

Higashihiroshima, Hiroshima 739-8526, Japan

⁴ Institute of Dinosaur Reseach, Fukui Prefectural University, 4-1-1 Kenjojima, Matsuoka, Eiheiji, Fukui, 910-1195, Japan

ABSTRACT

The Early Cretaceous ichnofossils of birds numerously occur in South Korea and China. Together with rich skeletal record from northeastern China, they facilitate our understanding about distribution and diversity of birds during the time. In contrast, in Japan, the fossil record of the Early Cretaceous birds is poorly known. Here, we report two ichnotaxa of the Early Cretaceous birds from the Aptian Kitadani Formation. We employ three-dimensional imaging techniques to objectively document and describe the specimens. Specimens include FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75 recovered from an alternating sequence of fine sandstone and mudstone of the Kitadani Formation cropping out in the Kitadani Dinosaur Quarry, Katsuyama, Fukui, Japan. FPDM-F-74 is large in size, bears slender digits with pointy ends (claw impressions), and lacks hallux and webbing traces. These characters allow assignment of FPDM-F-74 to cf. Aquatilavipes ichnosp. FPDM-F-74 is particularly large compared to other Aquatilavipes ichnospecies. FPDM-F-75 is smaller than FPDM-F-74, lacks hallux trace, and has webbing traces between digits II and III, and III and IV. It is assignable to cf. Gyeongsangornipes ichnosp. FPDM-F-75 is larger than most avian ichnotaxa with webbing traces. Its webbing traces between digits II and III, and III and IV are characterized by their extension only up to the proximal half of the digits. FPDM-F-75 differs from Gveongsangornipes locklevi from the Albian Jindong Formation, Gyeongsang, South Korea in having larger size and smaller divarication between digits II and IV, and the extension of webbing traces. These specimens indicate the presence of possibly two medium-sized avian taxa in the Kitadani Formation and increase our knowledge of the Early Cretaceous avifauna in Japan. Additionally, webbing traces in FPDM-F-75 and other late Early Cretaceous avian tracks from Asia may suggest that such morphological feature was common among the fossil birds during the time.

Key words : bird track, ichnology, Tetori Group, Early Cretaceous, three dimensional imaging

今井拓哉・築地祐太・東 洋一 (2018) 3 次元計測手法による,北谷層 (Aptian,福井県勝山市)から産出した鳥類足印化石の記録及び記載.福井県立恐竜博物館紀要 17:1-8.

前期白亜紀の鳥類足印化石は、韓国や中国から多数報告されている.これらの化石は、中国東北部で多産 する鳥類骨格化石と合わせて、当時の鳥類の分布や多様性を理解する上で重要な資料となっている.一方で、 日本における前期白亜紀の鳥類化石記録は非常に乏しい.本研究では、北谷層(Aptian)から産出した2種 の前期白亜紀鳥類生痕タクサを報告する.研究には、より客観的な足印の記録、記載を行うために、3次元計 測手法を用いた.標本はFPDM-F-74 及びFPDM-F-75 で、それぞれ福井県勝山市の北谷恐竜発掘現場に露出す る北谷層の、細粒砂岩と泥岩の互層から産出した.FPDM-F-74 は足印長、足印幅が大きく、細長い趾と尖っ た趾遠位端(鉤爪跡)が見られる一方、第一趾跡や水かき跡がない.これらの特徴から、FPDM-F-74 はcf. *Aquatilavipes* ichnosp.と同定される.FPDM-F-74 は他の*Aquatilavipes*の種と比較しても大きなことが特筆さ れる.FPDM-F-75 はFPDM-F-74 より小さい.また、第一趾跡が無いのは同じだが、第二趾と第三趾、及び第 三趾と第四趾の間に水かき跡が見られる点で異なる.FPDM-F-75 はcf. *Gyeongsangornipes* ichnosp.と同定され る.他の半蹼の鳥類足跡化石と比べて大きく、第二趾と第三趾、及び第三趾と第四趾間の水かき跡が趾全長の 半分未満しか張り出さないことが特徴である.FPDM-F-75 は、韓国慶尚道のJindong層(Albian)から産出す る*Gyeongsangornipes* lockleyiよりも大きく、総指間角が狭い上、水かき跡の張り出し加減が異なる.これらの 標本は、北谷層に2種の中型鳥類が存在することを示唆し、日本における前期白亜紀鳥類相に関する新たな知 見となる.また、FPDM-F-75 や他の複数のアジア産鳥類足跡化石に水かき跡が見られることから、この形態 学的特徴は珍しいものではなかったと考えられる.

Received July 29, 2018. Accepted November 16, 2018. Corresponding author—Takuya IMAI E-mail: t-imai * dinosaur.pref.fukui.jp

INTRODUCTION

Recently, our understanding about distribution and diversity of the Early Cretaceous bird tracks from East Asia was dramatically advanced. A ubiquitous number of the Early Cretaceous bird tracks is described from the Albian Haman and Jindong Formations of in the Gyeongsang, South Korea (Lockley et al., 2012). The bird tracks from South Korea represent a great variety of size and forms and include at least five avian ichnofamilies. In addition, the Lower Cretaceous of various regions across China has yielded numerous bird tracks (Lockley et al., 2013). Together with the rich skeletal remains of birds from northeastern China and north China, the fossil record indicates that birds were a major component of the ecosystem in the continental Asia during the Early Cretaceous.

In contrast to these continental regions, fossil record of the Early Cretaceous birds is quite limited in Japan and restricted to the Berriassian to Aptian non-marine deposits cropping out in central Honshu (main island). In this regard, the fossil record of birds in the Tetori Group was first documented by Azuma (1993, Ph.D. dissertation) where seven separate bird tracks from the Aptian Kitadani Formation, uppermost Tetori Group, Katsuyama, Fukui are documented through photographs. Unwin and Matsuoka (2000) reports fragmentary bird skeletons from the Hauterivian Kuwajima Fromation, middle Tetori Group, Hakusan, Ishikawa, and suggests they may belong to Enantiornithes. Azuma et al. (2002) describes an assemblage of 37 avian tracks from the Hauterivian Itsuki Formation, middle Tetori Group, Ono, Fukui, and assigns them to a new ichnospecies Aquatiravipes izumiensis. In addition, Imai and Azuma (2015) describes a fossil eggshell fragment, Plagioolithus fukuiensis, from the Aptian Kitadani Formation and attributes it to an avian theropod.

The latter formation has been known to produce abundant vertebrate tracks (Azuma, 2003; Lee at al., 2010; Tsukiji et al., 2018), and putative avian tracks were occasionally recognized among them. Here, employing 3D imaging techniques as recommended by Arakawa et al. (2002), we describe two different morphotypes of bird tracks from the Kitadani Formation, FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75. Examination of the specimens adds to our database of the Early Cretaceous avian fossil record and aids our understanding of avifauna during the Early Cretaceous of Japan.

GEOLOGICAL SETTINGS

The Tetori Group, distributed in central Japan, consists of marine and non-marine deposits of the Middle Jurassic to the Early Cretaceous in age. This group is subdivided into the Kuzuryu, Itoshiro, and Akaiwa Subgroups in ascending order (Maeda, 1961). A variety of terrestrial vertebrates is yielded in the Itoshiro and Akaiwa Subgroups (Fujita, 2003; Sano, 2015; Sano and Yabe, 2016). The Kitadani Formation occurs as the uppermost part of the Akaiwa Subgroup (Maeda, 1961), and was formed in a meandering fluvial system (Yabe and Shibata, 2011; Suzuki et al., 2015). The depositional age of the Kitadani Formation has



FIGURE 1. (A) Location map of Fukui, Japan, with distribution of the Tetori Group within the region. (B) Geological map around the Kitadani Dinosaur Quarry (red circle), modified from Shibata and Goto (2008). Keys: 1, Kitadani Formation and underlying Akaiwa Formation, Akaiwa Subgroup, Tetori Group; 2, Omichidani Formation; 3, Hida metamorphic rock; 4, Terrace deposit; 5, Nohi rhyolite; 6, Quaternary alluvial deposit; 7, Quaternary fan delta deposit; 8, Andesitic rock.



FIGURE 2. Photograph of the Kitadani Formation in the Kitadani Dinosaur Quarry, and a stratigraphic section of the formation taken at the red arrow in the photograph (modified from Tsukiji et al., 2018). The horizon from which the studied specimens were recovered is shown by the black arrow in the stratigraphic section.

recently been suggested as the Aptian (Sano, 2015; Sano and Yabe, 2016).

The bird tracks described here come from the Kitadani Dinosaur Quarry. The quarry, where the Kitadani Formation crops out, is located along the left bank of Sugiyama River in the



FIGURE 3. Measurement of tracks. See Leonardi (1987) for details. Abbreviations: Div, divarication angle; DL, digit length; DW, digit width; TL, track length; TW, track width.

northern part of Katsuyama, Fukui (Fig.1). Abundant vertebrate fossils including dinosaurs were collected from the quarry since 1989 (e.g., Azuma and Currie, 2000; Kobayashi and Azuma, 2003; Azuma et al., 2016). Furthermore, numerous vertebrate tracks, including those of amphibians (?), pterosaurs, and nonavian dinosaurs, were recovered (Azuma, 2003; Lee at al., 2010; Tsukiji et al., 2018). The specimens in this study occur in an alternating sequence of mudstone and fine sandstone within the Kitadani Formation along with amphibian (?), pterosaur, and nonavian theropod tracks (Fig. 2). Suzuki et al. (2015) interprets this sequence as a channel-fill deposit.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

In total of seven putative bird tracks were collected in 1991 from the Kitadani Formation in the Kitadani Dinosaur Quarry. Among them, two tracks, FPDM-F-74 (first documented by Azuma, 1993) and FPDM-F-75 (new specimen) exhibited clear topographic differences that could be captured with portable 3D imaging devices (Artec Spider and Artec Eva, Artec 3D), and further examined in this study. Upon acquiring the 3D data, they were processed to topographic images by image analysis software (VIVID2Rugle and 3D-Rugle, Medic Engineering Corporation). For measurements of tracks, we followed Leonardi (1987) (Fig. 3). Because digital pads are ambiguous in the studied specimens for measurements of true digit lengths, we measured free length (*sensu* Leonardi, 1987) instead.

SYSTEMATIC PALEONTOLOGY

Ichnofamily AVIPEDIDAE Sarjeant and Langston, 1994

Diagnosis.—Avian track showing three digits all directed forward; digits united or separate proximally; webbing lacking or limited to the most proximal part of the interdigital hypex.

Ichnogenus Aquatilavipes Currie, 1981

Diagnosis.—Three slender functional pedal digits; average total divarication angle > 100° , sharp claws; hallux impression lacking; and digit IV longer than digit II.

cf. Aquatilavipes ichnosp. (Fig. 4A-C)

Materials.—FPDM-F-74, single natural cast of left pes.

Horizon and Locality.—Kitadani Formation, Akaiwa Subgroup, Tetori Group, Kitadani Dinosaur Quarry, Katsuyama, Fukui, Japan.

Description.—FPDM-F-74 is 60 mm long and 94 mm wide, and TL/TW ratio is 0.63. Lengths of digits II, III, and IV are 40 mm, 50 mm, and 48 mm, respectively. Digit widths of digits II, III, and IV are 4 mm, 5 mm, and 7 mm, respectively. Divarication angles are 56° between digits II and III, and 61° between digits III and IV, resulting in the total divarication angle of 117° between digits II and IV (Table 1). Pointy distal ends, claw traces, are observed on digits II, III, and IV; those on digits II and IV curve slightly distally. Sediment fracture obscures portion of digit II, III, and IV proximally. In total of three digital pads are observable on the digit IV. Web traces are not observable. Heel impression is, while partially obscured, shallow-U shaped. Hallux trace is absent. Three-dimensional scan data is available in STL format as supplementary data (https://www.dinosaur.pref.fukui.jp/archive/memoir/17_Imai_supplemental_materials.zip).

Ichnofamily incertae sedis Ichnogenus GYEONGSANGORNIPES Kim, Kim, Oh, and Lee, 2013

Diagnosis.—Asymmetrical semipalmate, strong mesaxonic bird track with three widely splayed thin digits impressions (II–IV) with sharp end, asymmetrical web traces proximal to mesial between digits II–III–IV

cf. Gyeongsangornipes ichnosp. (Fig. 4D-F)

Material.—FPDM-F-75, single natural cast of left pes.

Horizon and Locality.—Kitadani Formation, Akaiwa Subgroup, Tetori Group, Kitadani Dinosaur Quarry, Katsuyama, Fukui, Japan.

Description.—FPDM F-75 is 50 mm long and 71 mm wide, and FL/FW ratio is 0.71. Lengths of digits II, III, and IV are 29 mm, 35 mm, and 27 mm, respectively. Digit widths of digits II, III, and IV are 6 mm, 5 mm, and 7 mm, respectively. Divarication angles are 55° between digits II and III, and 46° between digits III and IV, resulting in the total divarication angle of 101° between digits II and IV (Table 1). Possible claw traces are present on digit III and IV. Likely webbing traces between digits II and III, and digits III and IV characterizes the specimen. Webbing traces extend less than half the lengths of digits. Heel impression is, while obscured, shallow-U shaped. Hallux trace is not observable.



FIGURE 4. Photographs (left), topographic images (center), and line drawings (right) of the studied specimens. (A–C) FPDM-F-74. (E–F) FPDM-F-75. All are in the same scale. Dotted lines denote ambiguous track outlines. A contour interval is 0.3 mm. Note that the specimens are natural casts and appear convex.

Three-dimensional scan data is available in STL format as supplementary data.

DISCUSSION

Conventionally, Mesozoic tridactyl tracks with total divarication angles between digits II and IV > 100° have been assigned to birds (e.g., Currie, 1981). Lockley et al. (1992) provides a list of criteria to distinguish fossil avian tracks. These criteria include: 1, similarity to those of extant birds; 2, small size; 3, slender digit impressions, with indistinct differentiation of digital pad impressions; 4, wide divarication angle (approximately $110^{\circ}-120^{\circ}$) between digits II and IV; 5, a posteriorly directed hallux; 6, slender claws; 7, distal curvature of lateral (II and IV) claws away from the central axis of the foot; 8, track density; 9, associated fossils and feeding behavior; and 10, sedimentological evidence regarding track-bearing deposits. This interpretation was recently challenged by Xing et al. (2015), which argues

that extant-large-bird tracks may exhibit divarication angles < 100° and small-non-avian-theropod tracks have been reported to exceed total divarication angles of 100°. Xing et al. (2015) recommends using the footprint length to pace length ratio to confidently differentiate large-bird tracks and small-non-aviantheropod tracks. While the approach suggested by Xing et al. (2015) is acceptable, FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75 are isolated tracks and do not permit measurements of the pace lengths. Therefore, we assign FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75 to birds based on the following criteria after Lockley et al. (1992): 1, relatively small size compared to majority of non-avian theropod tracks; 2, slender digit impressions with indistinct digital pad impressions; 3, total divarication angles between digits II and IV > 100° ; 4, slender claws; and 5, distal curvature of lateral claws away from the central axis of the foot. In FPDM-F-75, this interpretation is supported by the presence of webbing traces, which are not known from non-avian-theropod tracks to date. We also plotted total divarication against TL for selected small non-avian theropod

TABLE 1. Measurements of the studied specimens. Abbreviations: TL, track length; TW, track width.

Specimens	TL (mm)	TW (mm)	TL/TW	Digit lengths (mm)			Divarication			Digit widths (mm)		
				П	Ш	IV	-	III-IV	II-IV	П	III	IV
FPDM-F-74	60	94	0.63	45	50	48	56	61	117	4	5	7
FPDM-F-75	50	71	0.71	29	35	27	55	46	101	6	5	7



FIGURE 5. Scatter plot of TL (track length) against Div (divarication) for selected non-avian theropod ichnotaxa, the Early Cretaceous avian ichnotaxa, and FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75 listed in Table 2.

tracks and the Early Cretaceous avian tracks that were previously described (Table 2), and added FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75 to the scatterplot. These specimens are plotted with the cluster of avian tracks (Fig. 5), which is concordant with our interpretation.

Both FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75 are characterized by relatively-large size and shallow-U-shaped heel impressions. On the other hand, major differences between the specimens include divarication angles between digits II and IV and presence of webbing traces only in FPDM-F-75. Nonetheless, these differences do not necessarily indicate that different species left the traces. For example, total divarication angles between digits II and IV is known to vary over $\pm 10^{\circ}$ in a large wading bird, Ardea herodias (Xing et al., 2015) from the average. Thus, it is possible the difference of divarication angles between FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75 merely represents this variation. While FPDM-F-75 does not exhibit webbing traces, it is possible that the lack of the webbing traces in FPDM-F-74 results from poor preservation. Thus, while we assign them to different ichnotaxa, their ichnomorphological differences possibly reflect preservational artefact.

FPDM-F-74 is characterized by its large size, which exceeds

TABLE 2. List of selected small non-avian theropod ichnotaxa, the Early Cretaceous avian ichnotaxa, and FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75, with Div (divarication), TL (track length), and TW (track width).

	Ichnotaxon	TL (mm)	TW (mm)	Div (°)	Age	Country	Reference
	Grallator emensis	27	16	89	Early Cretaceous	China	Zhen et al., 1994
Theropoda	Grallator isp.	130	80	53	Barremian	China	Xing et al., 2009
	Minisauripus chuanzhuensis	30	18	25	Early Cretaceous	China	Zhen et al., 1994
	Minisauripus zhenshuonani	26	18	47	Berriassian-Barremian	China	Xing et al., 2016
	Minisauripus zhenshuonani	61	38	25	Aptian	South Korea	Lockley et al., 2008
	Ornithomimipodidae indet.	13	11	51	Late Cretaceous	USA	Lockley 2011
	Theropoda indet.	68	44	35	Toarcia–Plienbachian	USA	Lockley, 2011
	Theropoda indet.	38	31	87	Toarcia–Plienbachian	USA	Rainforth and Lockley, 1996
Aves	Aquatilavipes isp.	36	43	105	Aptian-Albian	South Korea	Kim et al., 2012; Huh et al., 2012
	Aquatilavipes isp.	40	44	104	Early Cretaceous	China	Xing et al., 2011
	Aquatilavipes swiboldae	45	57	113	Aptian	Canada	Currie, 1981
	Aquatiravipes sinensis	31	38	115	Early Cretaceous	China	Zhen et al., 1994
	Archaeornithipus meijidei	12	12	118	Berriassian	Spain	Vidarte, 1996
	Avipedidae indet.	32	43	113	Early Cretaceous	China	Li et al., 2002
	Donyangornipes sinensis	35	40	100	Albian-Cenomanian	China	Azuma et al., 2013
	Goseongornipes isp.	40	55	120	Early Cretaceous	China	Xing et al., 2011
	Goseongornipes markjonesi	33	44	145	Albian	South Korea	Lockley et al., 2006
	Gyeongsangornipes lockleyi	32	41	128	Early Cretaceous	South Korea	Kim et al., 2013
	Ignotornis gajinensis	57	55	130	Aptian-Albian	South Korea	Kim et al., 2012
	Ignotornis mcconnelli	42	47	107	Albian-Cenomanian	U.S.A.	Mehl, 1931; Lockley et al., 2009
	<i>Ignotornis</i> isp.	26	34	116	Aptian-Albian	South Korea	Lim et al., 2000
	Ignotornis yangi	33	45	123	Aptian-Albian	South Korea	Kim et al., 2006
	Jindongornipes kimi	60	75	137	Albian	South Korea	Lockley et al., 1992
	Koreanaornis anhuiensis	33	36	123	Early Cretaceous	China	Jin and Yan, 1994; Lockely et al., 2013; Xing et al., 2018
	Koreanaornis cf. hamanensis	24	34	118	Albian-Cenomanian	China	Azuma et al., 2013
	Koreanaornis dodsoni	46	51	87	Early Cretaceous	China	Xing et al., 2011
	Koreanaornis hamanensis	27	34	113	Albian	South Korea	Kim, 1969; Lockley et al., 1992; Kim et al., 2013
	Koreanaornis lii	32	46	137	Aptian-Albian	China	Xing et al., 2016
	Limiavipes curriei	79	63	150	Albian	Canada	McCrea et al., 2001; McCrea et al., 2014
	Magnoavipes asiaticus	18	18	89	Early Cretaceous	China	Matsukawa et al., 2014
	Moguiornipes robusta	51	56	94	Early Cretaceous	China	Xing et al., 2011
	Paxavipes babcockensis	27	30	100	middile-?upper Albian	Canada	McCrea et al., 2015
	Shandongornipes muxiai	66	53	153	Aptian-Albian	China	Li et al., 2005; Lockley et al., 2007; Lockley et al., 2013
	Tatarornipes chabuensis	52	60	110	Barremian	China	Lockley et al., 2012
	Wupus agilis	102	70	98	Berriasian-Santonian	China	Xing et. al., 2007; Xing et al., 2015
	FPDM-F-74	60	94	117	Aptian	Japan	This Study
	FPDM-F-75	50	71	101	Aptian	Japan	This Study

other Mesozoic *Aquatiravipes* ichnospecies. Nonetheless, even larger Early Cretaceous avian ichnotaxa, such as *Shandongornipes muxiai* Li, Lockley, and Liu, 2005, and *Limiavipes curriei* McCrea and Sarjeant, 2001, are known (Table 2). Thus, FPDM-F-74 is not exceptionally large among the avian tracks from the Early Cretaceous. FPDM-F-74 exhibits the diagnostic characters for *Aquatilavipes* erected by Currie (1981) (i.e., three slender functional pedal digits, average divarication angles > 100°, sharp claws, and no hallux impression, digit IV is longer than digit II). However, with only a single track, it is difficult to determine whether FPDM-F-74 is confidently assignable to *Aquatilavipes*.

Among known Mesozoic bird tracks with webbing traces, FPDM-F-75 is distinguished from all ignotornids by the lack of hallux impression (Kim et al., 2006). In addition, the size of specimens clearly exceeds those of other ignotorid ichnotaxa. The specimens are comparable in size to Sarjeantopodus semipalmatus Lockley, Nadon, and Currie, 2004, medium-sized webbed bird tracks from the Maastrichtian Lance Formation, Wyoming, U.S.A. However, in S. semipalmatus, the webbing traces between digits III and IV extends more than half the digit lengths, while not in FPDM-F-75. Dongyangornipes sinensis Azuma, Lu, Jin, Noda, Shibata Chen, and Zheng, 2003, is another bird ichnotaxon of middle-sized semi-palmate tracks whose webbing traces extend from the distal end of digits II and IV. FPDM-F-75 is larger in size and has both webbing traces from less than half the length of each digit. FPDM-F-75 differs from Gyeongsangornipes lockleyi Kim, Kim, Oh, and Lee, 2013 from the Albian Jindong Formation, Gyeongsang, South Korea in having larger size and smaller divarication. In addition, unlike G. lockleyi, FPDM-F-75 has both webbing traces extending less than half the length of digits.

The webbing trace in FPDM-F-75 is small in comparison to those of other fossil and extant birds, and its function for propulsion on or in the water is questionable. Indeed, according to Leonardi (1987, p. 47), (interdigital) web is regarded as "... characteristic of partially or wholly aquatic animals." However, in extant birds, interdigital web is present even in non-aquatic taxa such as grouse and some domesticated Galliformes (Kochan, 1994). The web of these birds is smaller than those in aquatic and semi-aquatic birds and comparable to the one inferred for FPDM-F-75. Thus, interdigital web does not necessarily imply water-related habitat and "incipient web" can be present in fossil birds for other (yet unknown) functional purposes.

Discovery of FPDM-F-74 and FPDM-F-75 in the Kitadani Formation indicates the presence of possibly two medium-sized avian taxa and increases our knowledge of the Early Cretaceous avifauna in Japan. Additionally, web traces in FPDM-F-75 and other aforementioned late Early Cretaceous avian tracks from Asia may suggest such morphological feature was not uncommon among the fossil birds during the time. The lack of trackways does limit our understanding about the ichnotaxonomy and ichnomorphology of the avian tracks in the Kitadani Formation, which should be elucidated with further excavation efforts in the formation in the future.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank members of the 1st Kitadani Dinosaur Excavation Project where the studied specimens were discovered. Especially, S. Hayashi contributed to the initial data collection and documentation of the specimens during the project. M. Shibata and S. Kawabe provided constructive comments to the manuscript. Access to Artec SpaceSpider was kindly provided by DataDesign Co., Ltd. (Nagoya, Aichi, Japan). We appreciate S. Ishigaki and T. Kubo for their thorough review and comments that greatly improved the manuscript.

REFERENCES

- Arakawa, Y., Y. Azuma, A. Kano, T. Tanijiri and T. Miyamoto. 2002. A new technique to illustrate and analyze dinosaur and bird footprints using 3-D digitizer. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum 1: 7–18.
- Azuma, Y. 1993. The Early Cretaceous dinosaur ichnofauna and its paleoenvironmental development in the Tetori Group, Japan. Ph. D. dissertation, The University of Tokyo, Tokyo, 155 pp.
- Azuma, Y. 2003. Early Cretaceous vertebrate remains from Katsuyama City, Fukui Prefecture, Japan. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum 2: 17–21.
- Azuma, Y., and P. J. Currie. 2000. A new carnosaur (Dinosauria: Theropoda) from the Lower Cretaceous of Japan. Canadian Journal of Earth Science 37: 1735–1753.
- Azuma, Y., Y. Tomida and P. J. Currie. 2002. Early Cretaceous bird tracks from the Tetori Group, Fukui Prefecture, Japan. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum 1: 1–6.
- Azuma, Y., J. Lu, X. Jin, Y. Noda, M. Shibata, R. Chen and W. Zheng. 2013. A bird footprint assemblage of the early Late Cretaceous age, Dongyang City, Zhejiang Province, China. Cretaceous Research 40: 3–9.
- Azuma, Y., X. Xu, M. Shibata, S. Kawabe, K. Miyata and T. Imai. 2016. A bizarre theropod from the Early Cretaceous of Japan highlighting mosaic evolution among coelurosaurians. Scientific Reports 6: 20478.
- Currie, P. J. 1981. Bird footprints from the Gething Formation (Aptian, Lower Cretaceous) of northeastern British Columbia, Canada. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology 1: 257–264.
- Fujita, M. 2003. Geological age and correlation of the vertebratebearing horizons in the Tetori Group. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum 2: 3–14.
- Huh, M., M. G. Lockley, K. S. Kim, J. Y. Kim, and S. G. Gwak. 2012. First report of *Aquatilavipes* from Korea: new finds from Cretaceous strata in the Yeosu Islands Archipelago. Ichnos 19: 43–49.
- Imai, T., and Y. Azuma. 2015. The oldest known avian eggshell, *Plagioolithus fukuiensis*, from the Lower Cretaceous (upper Barremian) Kitadani Formation, Fukui, Japan. Historical Biology 27: 1090–1097.
- Jin, Y., and H. Yan. 1994. Bird footprints discovered in the Cretaceous red bed of the Gunpey Basin, Anhui. Geology of Anhui 4 : 57–61. *

- Kim, B. K. 1969. A study of several sole marks in the Haman Formation. Journal of the Geological Society of Korea 5: 243– 258.**
- Kim, J. Y., S. H. Kim, K. S. Kim, and M. Lockley. 2006. The oldest record of webbed bird and pterosaur tracks from South Korea (Cretaceous Haman Formation, Changseon and Sinsu Islands): more evidence of high avian diversity in East Asia. Cretaceous Research 27: 56–69.
- Kim, J. Y., S. J. Seo, K. S. Kim, M. G. Lockley, H. S. Kim and K. S. Baek. 2012. A paradise of Mesozoic birds: the world's richest and most diverse Cretaceous bird track assemblage from the Early Cretaceous Haman Formation of the Gajin tracksite, Jinju, Korea. Ichnos 19: 28–42.
- Kim, J. Y., M. K. Kim, M. S. Oh and C. Z. Lee. 2013. A new semipalmate bird tracks *Gyeongsangornipes lockleyi* ichnogen. et ichnosp. nov., and *Koreanaornis* from the Early Cretaceous Jindong Formation of Goseong County, Southern Coast of Korea. Ichnos 20: 72–80.
- Kobayashi, Y., and Y. Azuma. 2003. A new iguanodontian (Dinosauria: Ornithopoda) from the Lower Cretaceous Kitadani Formation of Fukui Prefecture, Japan. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology 23: 166–175.
- Kochan, J. B. 1994. Birds: Feet & Legs. Stackpole Books, Mechanicsburg, 81 pp.
- Lee, Y. N., Y. Azuma, H. J. Lee, M. Shibata and J. Lu. 2010. The first pterosaur trackways form Japan. Cretaceous Research 31: 263–273.
- Leonardi, G. 1987. Discussion of the Terms and Methods; pp. 43–52 in G. Leonardi (ed.), Glossary and Manual of Tetrapod Footprint Palaeoichnology. Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico, Brasília.
- Li, D., Y. Azuma, and Y. Arakawa. 2002. A new Mesozoic bird track site from Gansu Province, China. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum 1: 92–95.
- Li, R. H., M. G. Lockley and M. W. Liu. 2005. A new ichnotaxon of fossil bird track from the Early Cretaceous Tianjialou Formation (Berremian-Albian), Shandong Province, China. Chinese Science Bulletin 50: 1149–1154.
- Lim J, Z. Zhou, L. D. Martin, K. S. Baek and S. Y. Yang. 2000. The oldest known tracks of web-footed birds from the lower Cretaceous of South Korea. Naturwissenschaften 87: 256–259.
- Lockley, M. G. 2011. Putting the best foot forward: a single case of 'toe extension' has implications for the broader concept of 'toe extension' in theropod dinosaur feet and footprints. New Mexico Museum of National History Science Bulletin 53: 301–305.
- Lockley, M. G., J. Y. Kim, K. S. Kim, S. H. Kim, M. Matsukawa, R. H. Li, J. J. Li and S. Y. Yang. 2008. *Minisauripus*—the track of a diminutive dinosaur from the Cretaceous of China and Korea: implications for stratigraphic correlation and theropod foot morphodynamics. Cretaceous Research 29: 115–130.
- Lockley, M. G., R. Li, J. D. Harris, M. Matsukawa and M. Liu. 2007. Earliest zygodactyl bird feet: evidence from Early Cretaceous roadrunner-like tracks. Naturwissenschaften 94: 657–665.

- Lockley, M. G., J. Li, R. Li, M. Matsukawa, J. D. Harris and L. Xing. 2013. A review of the tetrapod track record in China, with special reference to type ichnospecies: implications for ichnotaxonomy and paleobiology. Acta Geologica Sinica 87: 1–20.
- Lockley, M. G., J. D. Lim, J. Y. Kim, K. S. Kim, M. Huh and K. G. Hwang. 2012. Tracking Korea's early birds: a review of Cretaceous avian ichnology and its implications for evolution and behavior. Ichnos 19: 17–27.
- Lockley, M. G., G. Nadon and P. J. Currie. 2004. A diverse dinosaur-bird footprint assemblage from the Lance Formation, Upper Cretaceous, eastern Wyoming: implications for ichnotaxonomy. Ichnos 11: 229–249.
- Lockley, M. G., S. Y. Yang, M. Matsukawa, F. Fleming and S. K. Lim. 1992. The track record of Mesozoic birds: evidence and implications. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B 336: 113–134.
- Maeda, S. 1961. On the geological history of the Mesozoic Tetori Group in Japan. Journal of the College of Arts and Sciences, Chiba University 3: 369–426.
- Matsukawa, M., M. G. Lockley, K. Hayashi, K. Korai, C. Peji and Z. Haichun. 2014. First report of the ichniogenus *Magnoavipes* from China: new discovery from the Lower Cretaceous intermountain basin of Shangzhou, Shaanxi Province, central China. Cretaceous Research 47: 131–139.
- McCrea, R. T., L. G. Buckley, A. G. Plint, P. J. Currie, J. W. Haggart, C. W. Helm and S. G. Pemberton. 2014. A review of vertebrate track-bearing formations from the Mesozoic and earliest Cenozoic of western Canada with a description of a new theropod ichnospecies and reassignment of an avian ichnogenus; pp. 5–93 in M. G. Lockley and S. G. Lucas (eds.), Tracking Dinosaurs and Other Tetrapods in Western North America, New Mexico Museum of Natural History Bulletin, 62.
- McCrea, R. T., L. G. Buckley, A. G. Plint, M. G. Lockley, N. A. Matthews, T. A. Noble, L. D. Xing and J. R. Krawetzh. 2015. Vertebrate ichnites from the Boulder Creek Formation (Lower Cretaceous: middle to ?upper Albian) of northeastern British Columbia, with a description of a new avian ichnotaxon, *Paxavipes babcockensis* ichnogen. et isp. nov. Cretaceous Research 55: 1–18.
- McCrea, R.T., and W. A. S. Sarjeant. 2001. New ichnotaxa of bird and mammal footprints from the Lower Cretaceous (Albian) Gates Formation of Alberta; pp. 453–478 in D. Tanke and K. Carpenter (eds.), Mesozoic Vertebrate Life. Indiana University Press, Bloomington.
- McCrea, R. T., W. A. S. Sarjeant, and J. O. Farlow. 2001. New ichnotaxa of bird and mammal footprints from the Lower Cretaceous (Albian) Gates Formation of Alberta; pp. 453–478 *in* D. H. Tanke, and K. Carpenter (eds.), Mesozoic Vertebrate Life: New Research Inspired by the Paleontology of Philip J. Currie. Indiana University Press, Blooomington.
- Mehl, M. G. 1931. Additions to the vertebrate record of the Dakota Sandstone. American Journal of Society 21: 441–452.
- Rainforth, E. C., and M G. Lockley. 1996. Tracks of diminutive

dinosaurs and hopping mammals from the Jurassic of North and South America; pp. 265–269 in M. Morales (ed.), The Continental Jurassic. Museum of Northern Arizona Bulletin 60. Phoenix.

- Sano, S. 2015. New view of the stratigraphy of the Tetori Group in Central Japan. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum 14: 25–61.
- Sano, S., and A. Yabe. 2016. Fauna and flora of Early Cretaceous Tetori Group in Central Japan: The clues to revealing the evolution of Cretaceous terrestrial ecosystem in East Asia. Palaeoworld 26: 253–267.
- Sarjeant, W. A. S., and W. Langston. 1994. Vertebrate footprints and invertebrate traces from the Chadronian (Late Eocene) of Trans-Pecos Texas. Texas Memorial Museum Bulletin 36: 1–86.
- Shibata, M., and M. Goto. 2008. Report of the 3rd Dinosaur Excavation Project in Katsuyama, Fukui, 2007. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum 7, 109–116. **
- Suzuki, S., M. Shibata, Y. Azuma, H. Yukawa, T. Sekiya and Y. Masaoka. 2015. Sedimentary environment of dinosaur fossil bearing successions of the Lower Cretaceous Kitadani Formation, Tetori Group, Katsuyama City, Fukui, Japan. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural Dinosaur Museum 14: 1–9.
- Tsukiji, Y., Y. Azuma, F. Shiraisi, M. Shibata and Y. Noda. 2018. New ornithopod footprints from the Lower Cretaceous Kitadani Formation, Fukui, Japan: ichnotaxonomical implications. Cretaceous Research 84: 501–514.
- Unwin, D. M., and H. Matsuoka. 2000. Pterosaurs and birds; pp. 99–104 in Shiramine Board of Education (ed.), Fossils of the Kuwajima "Kaseki-kabe" (Fossil-bluff) -Sicentific report on a Neocomian (Early Cretaceous) assemblage from the Kuwajima Formation, Tetori Group, Shiramine, Ishikawa, Japan.
- Vidarte, C. F. 1996. Primeras huellas de aves en el Weald de Soria (España). Nuevo icnogénero, Archaeornithipus y nueva icnoespecie A. meijidei. Estudios Geológicos 52: 63–75. ***
- Yabe, A., and M. Shibata, 2011. Mode of occurrence of *Brachyphyllum* from the Lower Cretaceous Kitadani Formation of the Tetori Group in Fukui Prefecture, Central Japan, with reference to its paleoecology. Memoir of the Fukui Prefectural

Dinosaur Museum 10: 77-88.****

- Xing, L. D., F. P. Wang, S. G. Pan and W. Chen. 2007. The discovery of dinosaur footprints from the Middle Cretaceous Jiaguan Formation of Qijiang County, Chongqing City. Acta Geologica Sinica 81: 1591–1602.*
- Xing, L. D., J. D. Harris, X. Y. Feng and Z. J. Zhang. 2009. Theropod (Dinosauria: Saurischia) tracks from Lower Cretaceous Yixian Formation at Sihetun, Liaoning Province, China and possible track makers. Geological Bulletin of China 28: 705–712.
- Xing, L. D., J. D. Harris, C. K. Jia, Z. J. Luo, S. N. Wang and J. F. An. 2011. Early Cretaceous bird-dominated and dinosaur footprint assemblages from the northwestern margin of the Junggar Basin, Xinjiang, China. Palaeoworld 20, 308–321.
- Xing, L. D., L. C., Buekley, R. T., McCrea, M. G., Lockley, J., Zhang., L., Piñuela, H., Klein and F., Wang 2015. Reanalysis of *Wupus agilis* (Early Cretaceous) of Chongqing, China as a large avian trace: differentiating between large bird and small non- avian theropod tracks. PLoS One 10: e0124039.
- Xing, L., M. G. Lockley, G. Yang, J. Cao, M. Benton and X. Xu. 2016. A new *Minisauripus* site from the Lower Cretaceous of China: Tracks of small adults or juveniles? Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 452: 28–39.
- Xing, L. D., Y. C. Hu, J. D. Huang, Q. He, M. G. Lockley, M. E. Burns and J. Fang. 2018. A redescription of the ichnospecies *Koreanaornis anhuiensis* (Aves) from the Lower Cretaceous Qiuzhuang Formation at Mingguang city, Anhui Province, China. Journal of Palaeogeography 7: 58–65.
- Zhen, S., J. Li, B. Zhang, W. Chen and S. Zhu. 1994. Dinosaur and bird footprints from the Lower Cretaceous of Emi County, Sichuan, China. Memoir of Beijing Natural History Museum 54: 105–124.

* : in Chinese with English abstract

- ** : in Korean with English abstract
- *** : in Spanish with English abstract
- **** : in Japanese with English abstract